

THE NEW YORK GENEALOGICAL AND BIOGRAPHICAL RECORD

VOL. 133



NUMBER 1

JANUARY 2002

Isaiah Smith, Loyalist Emigrant from Brookhaven,
Long Island, to Smithtown, New Brunswick

ISAIAH SMITH, LOYALIST EMIGRANT FROM BROOKHAVEN, LONG ISLAND, TO SMITHTOWN, NEW BRUNSWICK

BY JOHN E. D'ANIERI*

All publications which the author has seen to date on the Smiths of Smithtown, Parish of Hampton, Kings County, New Brunswick, have identified the Loyalist patriarch who founded the family as one James Smith, who is said to have come from Smithtown, Suffolk County, Long Island, and to have been a graduate of Harvard College.^[1] This article will establish that the patriarch was in fact Isaiah Smith, that he came from Coram in the Town of Brookhaven, Suffolk County, and that he was not a Harvard graduate.

It was known to many of his descendants as early as 1980 (and probably earlier) that the patriarch was named Isaiah, not James. Unfortunately no one saw fit to publish this correction, so the errors continue to be published currently.^[2] The only published allusion to this error to the writer's knowledge, until very recently, was a brief statement in the August 1980 issue of *Generations*, in a note by Mrs. Muriel Sweeney at the end of her cemetery listings entitled "Smithtown Loyalist Cemetery."^[3] She stated: "According to some records the first Smith who came to New Brunswick with the Loyalists was James, but I have old deeds where his eldest son Isaiah was referred to as Isaiah Jr., leading me to conclude that his name was Isaiah." An attempt to contact Mrs. Sweeney in later years was unsuccessful. However a visit to the Smithtown Loyalist Cemetery about 1995 revealed a memorial gravestone, put in place about 1984 by Muriel Sweeney and Hugh Hoeffler,^[4] and shown in Fig. 1.

* 1226 Godfrey Lane, Niskayuna, NY 12309. The author gratefully acknowledges the generous assistance of Edward H.L. Smith III of St. James, N.Y., and Theodore Sanford of East Islip, N.Y., who shared their extensive knowledge of early Smith families of Brookhaven. Beverly Guy of Toronto, Ontario, first suggested that Isaiah Smith came from Brookhaven and supplied copies of a number of New Brunswick land petitions and claims involving Isaiah Smith and his descendants that the author did not have. Hugh Hoeffler of San Antonio, Texas, provided his previously obtained evidence including a key deed that established Joanna as the wife of Isaiah. Robert Smith of St. Louis, Missouri, provided an explanation of how the names James and Isaiah had been confused in interpreting a Bible record. Julia Dicks of Nauwigewauk, New Brunswick, supplied a key Bible record and pointed out two land grants to Isaiah Smith that had been overlooked.

¹ One or more of the three claims are published in the following: Cleadie B. Barnett and Elizabeth S. Sewell, *Loyalist Families* (Fredericton Branch, United Empire Loyalists Association of Canada, c.1983); Andrew S. Beyea, *French Village . . . Its History and Romance* (1924), typescript copies at Provincial Archives of New Brunswick, Fredericton [hereafter PANB] and at New Brunswick Museum, Saint John; John B. Beyea, *Courage Through Adversity* (1978), copy at PANB; Paul J. Bunnell, *The New Loyalist Index* (1989); Emma McWhorter et al., *The History and Genealogy of the William Bull and Sarah Wells Family* (1983) [hereafter *Bull Genealogy*]; Gail B. Pipes, *Loyalists All* (New Brunswick Branch, United Empire Loyalist Association of Canada, 1985); Muriel D. Raymond, *John de Mill, Loyalist, His Ancestry and Descendants*, undated typescript at PANB, File MC1; Esther C. Wright, *The Loyalists of New Brunswick* (1955).

² Most recently in *Generations* [journal of the New Brunswick Genealogical Soc.] 21:4 (Winter 1999):21.

³ *Generations* 10 (reprint of vols. 1-10 of *Generations* by the Saint John Branch, N.B.G.S., 1989), p. 68. While the present article was being prepared, a brief article identifying Isaiah Smith was published by Hugh Hoeffler as "Isaiah Smith Senior of Smithtown, New Brunswick and Some of His Descendants," in *Memories* (newsletter of the Kings County, N.B., Historical Society) 39:2 (March 2000):1-3.

⁴ According to a letter from Hugh Hoeffler to the author dated 5 June 2000.

Both Muriel Sweeney's note and the gravestone inscription set the author on his quest to resolve the conflict.

The approach used to resolve the issue focused on three questions:

- What documentary evidence supports the existence of an elder James or Isaiah Smith in Kings County, New Brunswick, between 1783 and his alleged death in 1795?
- What documentary evidence supports a connection of this Loyalist with Suffolk County, New York, his alleged home prior to his emigration to New Brunswick?
- If the name Isaiah is correct, how did the erroneous name James come to be repeatedly published?

To avoid confusing identities of various members of this Smith family, we will start by identifying the elder Loyalist Isaiah (or James) as Isaiah¹.

Also for clarity's sake we will define now the children of Isaiah¹ Smith and certain of their vital records based on two Bible records. The first is headed "Landing of The Loyalists in NB – Smiths."⁵ Apparently in the same hand⁶ is a listing of birth dates and two death dates as follows:

Born		
Johannah Smith	Sept 6 - 175?	[last digit appears to be an earlier number overwritten as 7]
Isaiah Smith	Sept 13 - 17?9	[third digit appears as an earlier number overwritten as 5]
John Smith	May 6 - 1762	
Julia Smith	June 16 - 1765	
Mary Smith	Mar. 26 - 1768	
James Smith	Dec 9 1772	died May 27 - 1835
Elizabeth Smith	Mar 27 - 1775	" Dec 10 - 1819

⁵ This record is possessed by Robert Smith of St. Louis, Mo., a Smith descendant who generously provided a copy to the author with an accompanying explanation. It is a loose sheet of paper contained in a Bible handed down to him by his grandmother, Annetta (Clark) Smith, who was married in 1881 and died in 1945. Mr. Smith states that the record was in his grandmother's handwriting. It is this record which was cited by Mr. Smith as one of the sources for his submittal of James Smith as the Loyalist patriarch in *Loyalist Families*. This Bible record also shows (in the same hand) the descent from the below James² through Joseph³ to Joseph E.⁴ Smith, grandfather of the current possessor, Robert Smith. Additional comments were added later, some identified by Robert Smith as his own and some (three to six more) by unidentified others. Details are omitted because they are not pertinent to the issue at hand. There is one exception which will be discussed later (see note 8, below).

⁶ Except that the capital S in the surname "Smiths" in the heading is distinctly different from the capital S used to enumerate the seven Smith children. The remainder of the letters appear to be in the same hand. The use of different written forms of one or more letters by the same person is not unheard of. See the case of Richard Mills in *The New England Historical and Genealogical Register*, 154 (2000):202 and the Charlestown entries in *The American Genealogist*, 76 (2001):104.

TO THE MEMORY
OF THE LOYALISTS
AND THEIR DESCENDANTS
BURIED HERE
1734 ISAIAH SMITH 1795
HIS WIFE
1740 JOANNA DAVIS 1822
1771 JAMES SMITH 1834
HIS WIFE
1778 ELIZABETH BULL 1817
1760 SAMUEL SMITH 1834
HIS WIFE
1765 JULIA ANNA SMITH 1799
1815 JOHN SMITH 1903
HIS WIFE
1814 DOROTHY MARIA BLAIR 1885
THEIR DAUGHTER
1839 ANNA MARIA 1909

Fig. 1. Memorial at Smithtown, N.B.

From other sources,^[7] all dependent on family lore, the above are thought to be the children of Isaiah¹ and Joanna Smith. These other sources have various slight disagreements in dates (viz. different day in same month and year, or same day and month in years different by 1). There is a more significant discrepancy with Elizabeth, which is as yet unresolved.^[8] Resolution is beyond the scope of this article.

The second Bible record, apparently written by one of Isaiah¹'s grandchildren, reads as follows:^[9]

Grandfather Smith was Born March the 7 - 1734

Grandmother Smith was Born November the 21 - 1737

Father was Born September the 13 ... [*sic*] 1759 died March 30 1812

Mother was Born September the 11 ... 1760 died August 15 1846

Caleb Smith was Born May the 16 ... 1782 died October 15 1799

Ebenezer Smith was Born November the 14 ... 1785 [death entry illegible]

Ann Smith was Born September the 9 ... 1788 died [illegible]

Isaiah Smith was Born February the 4 ... 1790

James Smith was Born December the 11 ... 1791

Charity Smith was Born August the 11 ... 1793 died des. 15 1856

Jones Smith was Born March the 25 ... 1795

Charles Smith was Born October the 1 ... 1796

Julaner Smith was Born April the 30 ... 1800

Caleb N Smith was Born September the 14 ... 1802 died October 14th [edge of page missing]

Note that the birth date of "Father" in this record is the same as that of Isaiah² Smith in the first record. This indicates that "Grandfather" and "Grandmother Smith" were Isaiah¹ and his wife Joanna; and "Father" and "Mother" were Isaiah² (Isaiah¹) Smith and his wife Charity Newton. (More on Isaiah² and Charity (Newton) Smith is given below.)

That the above two Bible records are credible is shown by a number of public records described below, all of which are consistent with the dates shown above.

⁷ See note 1.

⁸ There appears to be some confusion between the wife and the sister of James Smith, both named Elizabeth. The dates of the birth and death of Elizabeth, sister of James Smith, are the same as the birth and death dates given in Raymond, *John de Mill, Loyalist*, for Elizabeth (Bull) Smith, wife of the above James. Raymond does not even list an Elizabeth as a sister of James. *Loyalist Families* gives the same birth date for Elizabeth Smith, sister of James, but has a different date of death, 25 Dec. 1808. *French Village, Bull Genealogy, Loyalists All* and the memorial gravestone give 1778 as the year of birth of Elizabeth Bull, wife of James Smith, and the latter two sources give her year of death as 1817. This confusion is further evidenced by notes in the Bible record written in a later hand. The first five names are encompassed by a brace pointing to a marginal note saying "Brothers & Sisters of James." The last two names are encompassed by a separate brace pointing to a marginal note saying "great g ____ [illegible]," probably indicating that they were great-grandparents of the writer of the note.

⁹ This record is in the possession of Karl Beyea of Hampton, N.B., a Smith descendant. A copy was kindly provided to the author by Beverly Guy. All of the birth entries are written in the same hand. The deaths were clearly entered at a later date, as they were squeezed into the margin in smaller letters which may or may not have been in the same hand as the births.

To answer the first question about documentary evidence in support of James or Isaiah Smith, the author undertook a detailed search of Loyalist claims for compensation from the British government for losses suffered in their former homes in the United States. This search was conducted in the Loyalist Collection at the Harriet Irving Library at the University of New Brunswick in Fredericton. The only James Smith found was a record note of a claim by a James Smith of Long Island, with no mention of where in Long Island he came from, where in Canada he resided, or what was the amount or the basis for his claim.^[10] The only claim involving an Isaiah Smith was one dated "April 25th 1786."^[11] It was filed by a man who identifies himself as ". . . Isaiah Smith late of Suffolk County on Long Island in the Province of New York but now of Kings County in His Majestys Province of New Brunswick . . ." (who later will be shown to be son of the patriarch Isaiah¹) and it asserts in part as follows:

. . . that this deponent during all such time /viz/ between the 15th of July 1783 and the 25th of March 1784 lived or Resided at New York and New Brunswick aforesaid excepting while crossing the seas from one Province to the other. . .

He claims as losses, in addition to two mares and a wagon:

. . . To being made a Prisoner by the Rebels and carried to Harford Gaol with a Brother and lose my whole summer. . . To . . . the House Plundered by the Rebels when I was taken Prisoner [and] To bearing Arms with the British Troop, as a vountier divers time and received no pay and pilloting by my father up and Down the Island &c

We will now proceed to the investigation of a second source, the so-called Carleton Papers.^[12] An index of names contained in these voluminous papers is maintained at the National Archives of Canada. At the author's request a search was made of the Papers for any James or Isaiah Smith residing in Coram or Brookhaven or Suffolk County, New York, or in Smithtown or Hampton or Kings County, New Brunswick. The result was that two items were found for Isaiah Smith. Although there were numerous references to James Smiths, none could be related to the James Smith in question.^[13]

The first item on Isaiah Smith was entitled "Derelict Property on Long Island from the 1st of April 1780 (unless otherwise expressed) for the relief of His Majesty's Loyal Subjects driven from their Habitations by the Rebels." Under "Suffolk County" were several listings, including one showing that a "House Farm and saw Mill" belonging to "Benjamin & Ephraim Mirvin" had been leased to Isaiah Smith at a yearly rent of £120.

¹⁰ British Public Record Office, Reference A.O. 12, sheet 110 (on microfilm).

¹¹ British Public Record Office, File A.O. 13/22, No. 3466 (on microfilm).

¹² Records of the British Headquarters in New York, file MG23B1 at the National Archives of Canada, Ottawa.

¹³ National Archives of Canada letters 8184-96-AM-AP/8790 dated 7 May 1996 and 8184-96-AM-AP/3863 dated 5 September 1996 from Mary Munk, Genealogical Consultant, to the author. The two items on Isaiah Smith were documents 9733-11 on microfilm reel M-366 and 9275-1 on reel M-365.

The second item on Isaiah Smith was entitled "List of Officers appointed in the Militia destined for Nova Scotia since the last Return transmitted to Governor Parr dated 5th September 1783." This list was dated "New York 2nd October 1783." Under the subheading "St. John's River" (other locations were Port Rosemary and Annapolis) appears Commission No. 53 (among five others) commissioning Bar^w Crannell as Captain, John Smith as First Lieutenant, and Isaiah Smith as Second Lieutenant. The commissions were dated 13th September 1783.

Some explanation is in order. At the date of this action New Brunswick had not been set off from Nova Scotia as a separate province. The militia unit was not a military unit, but was a group of civilian Loyalist refugees organized into companies for purposes of administration and support during the harrowing move from New York and resettlement in New Brunswick.^[14] The port of departure and the destination, combined with the fact that an Isaiah Smith Sr. and Jr. are the only Isaiahs elsewhere recorded among the list of Loyalist emigrants from New York to New Brunswick,^[15] point to our Isaiah being the Second Lieutenant. Whether it is father (then age 49) or son (then age 24) is not clear. However, one suspects that First Lieutenant John Smith may well have been the brother of Second Lieutenant Isaiah, both being sons of Isaiah Sr.

A systematic review was then undertaken of all indexed land petitions, land grants, and deeds in Kings County, New Brunswick, between 1783 (the year of the Loyalists' arrival) and 1800 (five years after the claimed death of Isaiah, Sr.) to uncover all records of a James or Isaiah Smith in that period. Although various researchers, particularly Mrs. Guy and Mr. Hoeffler (see note *, above) had kindly sent to the author many of these documents, it was not apparent that a comprehensive search had previously been done for both James and Isaiah. Such a search was conducted and revealed twenty-two documents for Isaiah Smith and James Smith. They are abstracted as follows, in chronological order:^[16]

- 11 Aug. 1784 - 250 acres on Lot 26, Hammond River in Hampton granted to Isaiah Smith.
- 14 Aug. 1784 - Gov. Parr of Nova Scotia grants 1,459 lots in Parrtown [now part of Saint John] to refugees who had arrived by ship from New York, including 18 Smiths, among whom are one James [Lot 1043], and one John Isaiah [Lot 527], but no Isaiah. [Because of the crowded conditions which were unsuitable for farming, many refugees soon sold or abandoned these lots for more desirable farmland upstream on the St. John River and its tributaries or along the Bay of Fundy shore. Although these lots are not in Kings County, they are included here for record purposes.]

¹⁴ See David G. Bell, *Early Loyalist Saint John* (1983), for more on this subject.

¹⁵ *Ibid.*, Appendix VIII, p. 241.

¹⁶ Kings County (N.B.) Deed Registry Books, 1785-99, on microfilm reel F-6226; New Brunswick Land Petitions, on microfilm reels F1025, F1028, F1035 and F1036; New Brunswick Land Grant Index, File RS 686 [all at PANB]. Also New Brunswick Land Grants, 2:292-94, Family History Library film 862077.

- 25 Jan. 1785 - Petition by Isaiah, John Isaiah and Samuel Smith et al. to resurvey and reapportion their lots on the Little Kennebeckasis [now Hammond] River. Dated at Parr Town. [Note that in this document Isaiah and John Isaiah Smith are two different people.]
- 28 Mar. 1785 - Isaiah Smith Jr. petitions for Lot 12 on Great Kannebeccasis River. Granted.
- 19 Apr. 1785 - Isaiah Smith Jr. petitions for 150 acres on Kennebecasis River 30 rods from Darling's Island. Not previously granted. Referred for consideration.
- 21 Apr. 1786 - Isaiah Smith claims reimbursement for losses suffered in war [see above]. Dated at "City Saint John." Rejected.
- 1 July 1788 - Isaiah Smith Sr. petitions for Lot 11 on north side of Kenebeckasis River for son and daughter James and Julianner Smith, "man and woman grown." Dated at Sussex, Kings Co. Granted. [Note that according to the memorial gravestone inscription (Fig. 1) James and Julianner would then have been about 17 and 23 respectively. Also what is now the Parish of Hampton was set off from Sussex in 1795.]
- 2 Feb. 1789 - Peleg Wiswall petitions for "lands marked No. 10 & 11 laying upon the Salmon River of the Kenebecasis." Lots are "opposite the lands of George Leonard, Esq." Dated in Saint John. The outer summary of this petition notes that "11 is registered to Isaiah Smith." [Comparison of a 1788 map of the St. John River and its tributaries with a current map of Kings County shows that this Salmon River is now called Smith's Creek. This Lot 11 appears to be the one described¹⁷ as land in the Parish of Sussex granted to James (i.e. Isaiah) Smith and his son Isaiah after their arrival in New Brunswick but before their settlement on the Hammond River, and which "since for them has been known as Smith's Creek." If so, it is in the current Parish of Studholm, which was set off from Sussex in 1840.]
- 17 Feb. 1789 - George Leonard petitions for "those lots of land lying on the Kenebecasis Salmon River from No. 10 to 17 (both inclusive) opposite the land he now possesses. . . ." Dated at Sussex Vale, Kings Co. Once again, the outer summary notes "complied with excepting No. 11 which is registered to Isaiah Smith." Granted.
- 20 July 1789 - Isaiah Smith Jr. asks a lot of 200 acres north of the Hammond River and five miles up the North Mill Stream [now probably Salt Springs Brook]. Granted.
- 18 Mar. 1791 - 175 acres on Lot 11, Salmon River in Sussex, granted to Isaiah Smith. [See petition of 2 Feb. 1789 above.]
- 15 July 1791 - Isaiah Smith Sr. sells to Allen Wager Lot 11 on the Salmon River in the Parish of Sussex [now Smith's Creek in the Parish of Studholm]. A marginal note says that "Joanah Smith, Wife of the said Isaiah the grantor . . . did sign . . . the within written instrument freely. . . ." It is witnessed by "Saml Haines Smith" [see below]. It should be noted that it is difficult to distinguish between the abbreviations Sen^r and Jun^r in the handwritten text. Of the three mentions of Isaiah, the first two appear to be followed by the abbreviation "Jen^r"; whereas the third Isaiah is followed by the abbreviation "Sen^r." In the first two cases The J appears different from the preceding S in Smith. In all three cases the following letters "en^r" are not in doubt. From the context it is clear that all three Isaiahs are the same person. The reference to wife Joanah resolves the issue. The wife of Isaiah Jr. was named Charity.

¹⁷ Beyea, *French Village*, 58.

- 2 Feb. 1793 - Isaiah Smith of Parish of Sussex petitions to enlarge his 200-acre lot [see 20 July 1789 petition] to 400 acres. He states that he came with the first Loyalists in the province and that he now has a wife and five children, four of whom are sons. The petition is endorsed by Joshua Upham [identified in the deed of 4 Nov. 1796 below as Justice of the Supreme Court]: "Mr. Smith the petitioner is an industrious, deserving man &, if possible I wish the prayer of his petition may be granted." [The description of his children identifies him as Isaiah Jr.]
- 28 Jan. 1794 - Caleb Birdzell sells to James Smith of Kings County, yeoman, part of Lot 20 bounded by "the river" and "the mill stream." [Caleb Birdsall's deed of purchase on 15 May 1789 describes Lot 20 as "situated on Hammond River in the Parish of Sussex in Kings County."]
- 20 Feb. 1794 - Isaiah Smith Senr of Sussex, Kings County, and his wife Joannar sell to Isaiah Smith Junr of Sussex, yeoman, Lot 26 on the Hammond River in Sussex "Whereon the Said Isaiah Smith Junr now lives." Witnessed by Samuel Smith and Juliannar Smith. [The Kings County Index says that this property is in Hampton Parish.]
- 15 Mar. 1794 - Robt. McKee sells to James Smith of N.B., yeoman, part of the western half of Lot 21, bounded on the north by "the River" [i.e. the Hammond River] and west and south by the land and mill of Isaiah Smith [Jr. or Sr. not designated] on same lot. Witnessed by Isaiah Smith, Sr. and Simon Malerey. [The Kings County Index says this land is in Hampton Parish. I found no explicit record of either a grant or sale of any part of Lot 21 to Isaiah Smith.]
- 15 Mar. 1794 - Parts of Lots 21 and 22 on the Hammond River sold to James Smith of Sussex, yeoman, by Simeon Mallery. Witnessed by Isaiah Smith, Sr. [The Smith Cemetery (also known as Smithtown Loyalist Cemetery) is near the boundary between Lots 20 and 21, close to the Hammond River.]
- 11 Aug. 1795 - Parts of Lots 17 and 18 in Hampton on the south side of the Hammond River sold to James Smith by Reuben Craft. Witnessed by Simeon Mallery and Caleb Wetmore. [Not witnessed by Isaiah Smith Sr. who died 18 days later.]
- 4 Nov. 1796 - Isaiah and Charity Smith of Parish of Hampton, Kings County, N.B. sell to Thomas Murray half of Lot 22 in Hampton. Witnessed by Samuel Smith and Joshua Upham, Justice of the Supreme Court.
- 13 June 1797 - Sarah Murray, widow of the late Thomas Murray and executor of his estate, sells to Isaiah Smith of Hampton, farmer, half of Lot 22 and all of Lots 23 and 24 in Hampton, all on the Hammond River. Witnessed by E. Chipman and Ward Chipman.
- 14 June 1797 - Isaiah Smith, farmer, and Charity his wife, both of Hampton, give a mortgage to Sarah Murray, widow, on the property bought on 13 June, above.
- 17 June 1797 - Isaiah Smith, gentleman, and his wife Charity, both of Hampton sell to James Fowler half of Lot 22 on the Hammond River previously sold to Isaiah by Mrs. Sarah Murray "by deed bearing date the thirtieth [should say "thirteenth"] day of this present month." Witnessed by J. Murray Upham and Joshua Upham, Justice of the Supreme Court.

Of the six records mentioning James Smith, the first (in 1784) pertains to property outside of Kings County and there is no indication that he was

from Kings County. The next (in 1788) says he is the son of Isaiah Smith, Sr. The remaining four (in 1794 and 1795) are all consistent with James² (then aged about 22 or 23), son of Isaiah. This James had recently (1 April 1793) married Elizabeth Bull of Hampton.^[18] Since James was rather young at the time, he may well have had a loan or other financial help from his father to complete the purchases. He may also have looked to his father to review and witness the first three deeds to guard against any problems. His father may well have been in his final illness and therefore unable to witness the last deed. It is worth noting that it was at about the same time (20 February 1794 – see above) that Isaiah Sr. sold Lot 26 to Isaiah Jr. Perhaps Isaiah Sr. had an inkling of his coming demise and arranged these land transactions to properly provide for his two sons remaining in New Brunswick.^[19]

Of the 19 documents involving Isaiah Smith, five (1788, 1791 and three in 1794) identify him as "Senior." Two of them also identify his wife as Joanna. Ten records (two in 1785, one each in 1786, '89, '93, '94, '96 and three in 1797) identify Isaiah as "Junior," either directly or indirectly (e.g. by identifying his wife as Charity; by referring to two of the same lots previously owned by him; by describing his children; or by his 1786 account of his losses on Long Island). Five records (1784, 1785, two in 1789, and 1791) are indeterminate as to Junior or Senior. (Because one document mentions both Isaiahs Senior and Junior, the 19 documents contain 20 mentions of Isaiah.)

Another source of information is the passenger and victualing lists prepared by the British Army in support of the resettlement of Loyalists from New York to New Brunswick.^[20] They list heads of household, former trade and home, civilian militia unit and ship, and family statistics at five separate points in time, viz. at New York before boarding ship, aboard ship, on arrival at Saint John, about May 1784, and again about June 1784. There is one entry each for Isaiah Smith Sr., Isaiah Smith Jr., and James Smith, none of whom had his former trade and home recorded. There is also an entry for a John Smith in the same militia unit 53, who is presumably the brother of Isaiah Jr. and was imprisoned with him in the Hartford Gaol. He may well be the same John who was commissioned First Lieutenant of militia unit 53 (see above).^[21] The passenger and victualing lists entries may be summarized as follows:

¹⁸ From family lore recorded in *Bull Genealogy*.

¹⁹ The other son, John, is said to have separated from his wife and returned to the United States. See Beyea, *French Village*, 59.

²⁰ See Bell, *Early Loyalist Saint John*, Appendix VIII. Heads of family are listed alphabetically by surname, then given name.

²¹ There are other Smiths in militia unit 53 (i.e. John Isaiah, Nathaniel, Samuel), whose relation, if any, to our Smiths is unknown. Samuel may be the one who later married Julianna² Smith and appeared in two documents abstracted above, one of which (petition of 25 Jan. 1785) gives Isaiah, John Isaiah and Samuel as co-petitioners.

- Isaiah Smith Sr. – Militia unit 53 aboard the *Alexander*. Family 11200^[22] aboard ship, 11311 in May 1784 and 11200 in June 1784. [No data on family in N.Y. before boarding or on arrival in Saint John. The *Alexander* sailed to Saint John in Sept.–Oct. 1783.^[23]
- Isaiah Smith Jr. – Militia unit 53 aboard the *Alexander*. Family 11011 in N.Y. before boarding ship, 10000 both in May 1784 and in June 1784. [No data on family aboard ship or on arrival in Saint John.]
- James Smith – Came with Spring Fleet of May 1783 before militia units were established, not with Militia Unit 53. Ship not reported. Family 10000 in N.Y. before boarding ship and 10000 on arrival in Saint John. [No record aboard ship or in May or June 1784.]
- John Smith – Militia unit 53 aboard the *Alexander*. Tailor. Family 10000 aboard ship and in May 1784. [No record in N.Y. before boarding ship, on arrival at Saint John, or in June 1784.]

A final source reviewed was probate records. Two Isaiahs of Kings County were found.^[24] The first Isaiah, of Hampton, died intestate. Administration was granted 7 July 1812 to Charity Smith and Ebenezer Smith, presumably the wife and the then eldest son of Isaiah². The second Isaiah, of Norton (adjoining Hampton), also died intestate, administration being granted 23 March 1819 to Abraham Baxter and Prudence Rush Smith. He would be Isaiah³ (Isaiah^{2,1}) who was murdered 24 December 1817, and is said to have married a Miss Baxter.^[25]

James Smith Senior of Hampton, Kings County wrote a will dated 29 November 1831, proved 26 June 1835. He bequeathed to daughters Marey, Elizabeth, Johannah and Jemimey; to sons James, Richard, Isiah [*sic*], John and Joseph; and to wife Marey.^[26] He also mentioned brother Isaiah. This places him as the son of our Isaiah¹ Smith.

To summarize the results of the above research:

- No evidence of a James Smith has been found that can be tied to a James Smith in Kings County, N.B., father of Joanna, Isaiah, John, Julia, Mary, James and Elizabeth.
- There is evidence recording Isaiah Smith Sr. in Kings County in the early years, including deeds or petition in 1788, 1791, and 1794, all before his purported death on 29 Aug. 1795.^[27]
- Both Isaiah Smiths Sr. and Jr. are included in militia unit 53 which sailed from New York to Saint John, N.B., in 1783. The James Smith who was granted land in Parrrtown in 1784 did not emigrate in the same militia unit and ship as the rest of our Smith family.

²² Numbers correspond (in order) to adult males, adult females, children ten or over, children under ten, and servants.

²³ See Bell, *Early Loyalist Saint John*, 31.

²⁴ R. Wallace Hale, *Early New Brunswick Probate Records 1785-1835* (1989), p. 415.

²⁵ Beyea, *French Village*, 59; also "HUE and CRY" dated in City of Saint John 28 Dec. 1818 and published in the *Royal Gazette* 12 Jan. 1819, seeking the apprehension of Francis Masten, the alleged murderer of Isaiah Smith of Norton.

²⁶ Marey Raymond was his second wife, whom he married in Hampton 1 Apr. 1821. Information provided by Beverly Guy, citing Kings Co. Marriage Register, vol. I (1812-44), PANB microfilm F75.

²⁷ Recorded on an earlier gravestone in the Smithtown Loyalist Cemetery which was reported by Muriel Sweeney in *Generations* 10 (note 3, above), p. 68. Note that this stone has since been replaced by a stone which gives only his year of death (1795).

- No James Smith which would fit a James¹ is found in probate records.
- One additional item of evidence is pertinent. More than 20 mentions have been found in the Town of Brookhaven Records for our Isaiah¹ Smith between Dec. 1750 and 7 May 1782.^[28] Thereafter he disappears from the Brookhaven records. This is consistent with his removal to New Brunswick in 1783.

What remains is to explain how it came to be that James, and not Isaiah, was identified as the Loyalist patriarch in Kings County, New Brunswick. The only explanation known to the author to date is one offered by Robert Smith,^[29] possessor of one of the Bible Records mentioned previously. In his submittal to *Loyalist Families*, Mr. Smith gave as one source "family bible entries," the same record transcribed above. Next to Isaiah¹'s son James is a later, hand-printed notation "JR." which was not added by Mr. Smith. Mr. Smith inferred from this that the father of this James must be a James Smith, Sr. But the question remains as to where James "JR." came from.

The first mention known to this author of James instead of Isaiah being the Smith patriarch in Smithtown, New Brunswick, was in Andrew Beyea's 1924 publication *French Village*, which is listed as a general source in the bibliography of Esther Wright's *The Loyalists of New Brunswick*, published in 1955, and so was likely the source of her error.^[30] From her book, which is frequently used as a reference, it probably spread to the later publications. Both Beyea and Wright also wrote local or family history columns for the Saint John, New Brunswick, newspapers, which spread the error further.

Andrew Beyea, a man of the highest personal integrity, was for many years a devoted student of the local and family history of his area. His contributions to later generations are acknowledged and respected. However, he relied heavily on family lore which he sought both locally and elsewhere. So his work, which has provided an excellent starting point for those researching the early Loyalists of Kings County, New Brunswick, must nevertheless be independently verified. To date this author has not discovered how Andrew Beyea came to believe that Isaiah¹ Smith was called James.

Thus far we have not established the veracity of the two bible records previously mentioned. To the author's knowledge, there is no independent corroboration in the public record of many of the birth, marriage, and death records contained therein. However there is some information available that at least is consistent with the bible records. That Isaiah¹ Smith had a son James and a daughter Julianner is given in his land petition of 1788. In a deed of 20 February 1794 he sells to another son Isaiah, Jr. On 12 February 1804, Isaiah Smith [son of the late Isaiah¹] petitions for land "for his brother John," thus accounting for the third son of Isaiah¹.

²⁸ *Records of the Town of Brookhaven, Book C, 1687-1789* (New York, 1931), *passim*. Edward Smith and Theodore Sanford brought this to the author's attention.

²⁹ Letter from Robert F. Smith to the author dated 20 Mar. 1997 [should be 1996].

³⁰ For these titles see note 1, above.

In the victualling list of May 1784, Isaiah Smith Sr. has three children 10 and over, and one child under 10. This would account for Julianna (then 18), Mary (then 16), James (then 12) and Elizabeth (then 9). Isaiah Jr. (then 24) and John (then 22) are shown as separate heads of house in the same list. Daughter Joanna (then 26) is recorded, along with a child under 10, in the household of Henry Ruland (whom she married by license dated 28 August 1781^[31]) aboard the *Alexander* en route to New Brunswick in September or October 1783.^[32]

In the 1776 census of Brookhaven is listed the family of an Isah [*sic*] Smith containing no males over 50, two males between 16 and 50, two males under 16, two females over 16 and three females under 16. These correspond to Isaiah¹ (then 42), his wife Joanna (then 38), sons Isaiah, John and James (then 16, 14 and 4 respectively), and daughters Johanna, Julianna, Mary, and Elizabeth (then 18, 11, 8 and 1 respectively).^[33] (This, incidentally, is the only Isaiah Smith recorded in the Suffolk County Census of 1776.)

The list of those in Suffolk County taking the loyalty oath to King George III in 1778^[34] includes Brookhaven residents Isaiah Smith Junr., age 19, farmer, and Isaiah Smith, age 42, farmer. While the age of Isaiah Jr. corresponds to his birth in 1759 recorded in the bible, his father's age based on the bible record should have been 43 or 44. Considering the age discrepancies typically found in records of this kind, the difference is not significant.

Similarly we have independent data that is consistent with the second bible record of the children of Isaiah² Smith. In the 1784 victualling list for his family before boarding ship in New York, Isaiah Smith Jr. has one son under ten, corresponding to Caleb (then 1). In his 1793 land petition Isaiah Jr. states that he has a wife and five children, including four sons. This accounts for his then sons Caleb (then 11), Ebenezer (then 8), Isaiah (then 3) and James (then 2) and daughter Ann (then 5). In an 1804 land petition on behalf of his son Ebenezer (who, upon the death of son Caleb in 1799, became the eldest son), Isaiah Smith said that he then had "a wife & eight children & five of the latter are sons." This corresponds to children Ebenezer (then 19), Ann (then 16), Isaiah³ (then 14), Charity (then 11), Charles (then 8), Julianer (then 4) and the second Caleb (then 2). The eighth

³¹ *New York Marriages Previous to 1784* (1860, repr. 1968), p. 331, courtesy of Beverly Guy.

³² Her husband apparently died between their departure for New Brunswick and the victualling lists of May and June 1784, wherein the Henry Ruland household, though still containing an adult female and a child under 10, no longer contains an adult male. This is confirmed by the previously mentioned grant of 14 Aug. 1784, which includes the grant of Lot 479 in Paratown to Widow Joanna Ruland. According to Beyea, *French Village*, 58, "Johanna Smith [later] married Joseph Baxter of Norton."

³³ Suffolk County Census of 1776 in *Calendar of Historical Manuscripts Relating to the War of the Revolution*, vol. 1 (1868), p. 387. This was first brought to the author's attention by Beverly Guy. It should also be noted that 1:48 of this same book reports that Isaiah, James, John, and Uriah Smith of the Fourth Company of Brookhaven signed the Association on 8 June 1775.

³⁴ "List of persons in Suffolk County, on Long Island, who took the following Oath of Allegiance and Peaceable behaviour Governor Tryon, 1778," British Public Record Office (London), copy at NYG&B of a transcript at the Suffolk County Historical Society.

child would be either James or Jones (who would then have been 14 and 10 respectively), one of whom presumably had previously died.^[35]

The marriage license of Isaiah² Smith and Charity Newton dated 4 June 1781 is recorded in New York.^[36] In a baptism register of the Rev. Thomas L. Moore, Episcopal minister of Islip [a town adjoining Brookhaven] the following entry dated 26 April 1783 appears: "Caleb Newton, Son of Isaiah & Charity Smith, born at Rongconkaway Pond 16 May 1782."^[37] Rongconkaway Pond, now Lake Ronkonkoma, is at the intersection of the town boundaries of Brookhaven, Smithtown, and Islip.

To date no confirmation has been found for the identity of Joanna Davis as the wife of Isaiah¹ Smith. From previously mentioned deeds in 1791 and 1794 her given name is clearly Joanna. Though there were many contemporary Davises in Brookhaven in her day,^[38] no independent record has been found, either of the purported birth of a Joanna Davis on 21 November 1737 or of the marriage of a Joanna Davis and Isaiah Smith. Julia Dicks of Nauwigewauk, New Brunswick, a Smith descendant, has reported^[39] that the only basis she has found for that identification in the papers of Andrew S. Beyea, author of *French Village*, is a 1929 letter to Beyea from an Edith Fowler of Boston who said: "It was a cousin who told me she thought Joanna may have been a Davis but she had no authentic record to back it up and just 'guessed it was.'" Joanna's maiden surname must therefore be considered questionable.

Before concluding this article, we should refute the various claims (see note 1) that Isaiah¹ was a Harvard graduate. Two compilations of Harvard graduates^[40] have been reviewed for any evidence of a James or an Isaiah Smith between 1746 and 1771. None was found. The Harvard Archives were consulted,^[41] also with a negative result. He was also said to be a civil engineer, but that has not been verified. Perhaps his performance of surveying work^[42] was thought to imply that he was a civil engineer.

³⁵ Other than James and Jones, all the children have some subsequent record of marriage and/or death to indicate they were alive in 1804. James and Jones have only a birth record, indicating that one of them probably died after Isaiah's petition of 2 Feb. 1793 and before this petition submitted 1 Nov. 1804.

³⁶ *New York Marriages Previous to 1784*, p. 358, courtesy of Beverly Guy.

³⁷ "Baptisms at Islip, Long Island, 1782-1789," REC. 121:136, courtesy of Theodore Sanford.

³⁸ Suffolk County Census of 1776 shows 21 Davis households in the Town of Brookhaven.

³⁹ Letter dated 26 Feb. 1996 from Julia A. Dicks to Beverly Guy. Copy in possession of the author.

⁴⁰ John L. Sibley and Clifford K. Shipton, *Sibley's Harvard Graduates* (1873-) and Harvard University, *Quinquennial Catalogue of Officers and Graduates 1636-1930* (1930).

⁴¹ Letters dated 10 and 22 Nov. 1995 to the author from Brian A. Sullivan, Curatorial Assistant at the Harvard University Archives, confirm that neither an Isaiah nor a James Smith attended or graduated from Harvard.

⁴² Theodore Sanford notes that *Records of the Town of Brookhaven, Book C, 1687-1789*, p. 371, says that on 6 June 1774 Isaiah and Uriah Smith were directed to "carry chains for survey of South Beach lots."